



Coral Triangle Programme (CTP)
WWF - Indonesia
Graha Simatupang Tower 2 Unit C Lt
7th-11th, Jalan Tahi Bonar Simatupang,
Jati Padang, Pasar Minggu, RT.4/RW.8,
Jakarta 12540



Yayasan Masyarakat dan Perikanan
Indonesia
Istana Regency Blok S No. 7
Pesanggaran, Denpasar, Bali –
80223, Indonesia | t: +62 361 4719020 |
e: info@mdpi.or.id |
w: www.mdpi.or.id

Sustainable Tuna Partnerships Phase 2
Supporting Harvest strategies and control rules in the WCPFC
**Sub-regional Multi-Stakeholder Dialogue February 15 -16 February 2023, Bangkok,
Thailand
Meeting Report**

Outline:

- I. Background
- II. Presentations and discussions in Day 1 and Day 2
- III. Feedbacks from Vietnam on the Manila SWOT analysis
- IV. Agreements – Day 1
- V. Agreements Day 2
- VI. Timeline for the next event

I. Background

A dialogue between the Indonesia Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (MMAF) and the Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN), Philippines Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR) and NFRDI, and Vietnam Directorate of fisheries (DFISH) and Research Institute for Marine and Fisheries (RIMF) was held at Ibis Sathorn Bangkok on February 15 -16 2023. The meeting was a follow up of the previous 1st dialogue meeting held in Manila on August 24-25 2022, where it resulted in 3 key outcomes: A SWOT analysis establishing common grounds for dialogue, areas for collaboration were identified and shared goals. A key outcome of the 1st dialogue meeting was the consensus to invite Vietnam to join the discussion to strengthen the sub-regional cooperation with a shared voice to the WCPFC. Therefore, the 2nd dialogue meeting in Bangkok, convenes the 3 countries with the following goals:

1. Reflections on outcomes from the WCPFC19 and collective position for WCPFC20
2. Understand Vietnam's experience in harvest strategies for tropical tunas
3. Gather feedback and input from Vietnam on 1st Dialogue outcomes: SWOT, areas for Collaboration, shared goals, agreed by Philippines and Indonesia.
4. Follow-up on action agreed from the August 2022 Dialogue in Manila. Actions agreed can be reviewed through this link ([hyperlink OR list actions below](#))
5. Plan for 2023 3-country Dialogues and pre-conference engagement

II. Presentations and discussions in Day 1 and Day 2

The first day of the meeting started with presentations from each country regarding their updates on the development of tuna harvest strategy at their archipelagic waters. The Head of the Research Center for Fishery - Research Organization for Earth Sciences and Maritime - from the Indonesian National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN), Fayakun Satria, presented that they have observed decreasing CPUE of approaching limit reference Point

(LRP). Therefore, they planned to have 10% catch reduction gradually, which will be launched as harvest strategy in Indonesian archipelagic waters (IAW) in their national tuna conference on May 2023. Meanwhile, Putuh Suadela, the coordinator of high seas and Indonesian economic exclusive zone from the MMAF, stated that the government of Indonesia has pushed for logbook implementation simultaneously to increase its 100% coverage.

Meanwhile, the Philippines delegate, Rafael Ramiscal and Isidro Tanangonan, from the Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (DA-BFAR) presented their updates that the Philippines had conducted a stakeholder consultation November 2022 for their National Plan of Action for the Management of Fishing Capacity. Additionally, on January 2023 there were 2 Fisheries Administrative Orders (FAO) approved, which is indicating allocations and limits for fishing operation in Philippine EEZ and Distant Waters.

The delegates from Vietnam presented their fisheries management measures, including their established tuna data collection system, observer program on tuna fishing vessels, and the implementation of Fisheries Improvement Programs (FIP) at some coastal provinces. The works have been resulted in better understanding of stock assessments, distribution of tuna species in the sea of Vietnam, catch estimations by species as well as the determination of MSY. The delegates from Vietnam also presented feedback on the SWOT analysis conducted in the previous dialogue meeting in Manila, August 2022, which stated the importance of establishing sub-region as a platform to share tuna data and information and also as a mechanism to manage the tuna fisheries within the Southeast Asian Waters. Thus, they totally support the continuation of the dialogue meeting in order to consolidate the unified voice from the three countries at the WCPFC. The detail of the Vietnam delegates feedback is presented in the next section.

It follows by a presentation from Finlay Scott from the Pacific Community (SPC), the scientific provider of the WCPFC, regarding the current progress of harvest strategy development for yellowfin tuna. It starts with the complexity of four different tuna managed at the WCPO, where they are caught by an overlapping mix fishery with different gears in overlapping regions. Therefore, according to them that the management measures of individual stocks in isolation might not be correct, and hence need mixed fisheries approach. In other words, SPC proposes no direct management procedures for yellowfin, as it will manage indirectly through the other management procedures. Furthermore, in answering one of the follow up questions, regarding on why it is not starting with the specific HS for YFT, which affect other fisheries, Finlay Scott stated that developing HS for every stock is never easy, it was perhaps easier to tackle the easier and get people used to the process to get the ball rolling. Rather than going for more complex. Start simpler and going through.

The next presentation comes from Bubba Cook, the WWF Coordinator for the WCPFC, regarding the outcomes from the WCPFC. This includes, the impact of covid, the adoption of Management Procedure (MP) for Skipjack on the last commission meeting (WCPFC19), as well as the agreed new timeline for the adoption of harvest strategy for other tropical tuna, and other outcomes, such as the change on the measures of transshipment, the development of crew labor standards and the adoption of the revised of conservation management measures for sharks. The presentation also stimulates a discussion among the

delegates from the three countries on how they agree on the next actions needed, particularly in the preparation of the upcoming Scientific and regular commission meeting (SC19 and WCPFC20), where the delegates identified the strong need for the three countries to continue the dialogue and to form unified voice at the WCPFC. Additionally, the delegates asked WWF to be as the interim secretariat to keep continuing in facilitating the three countries in consolidating their positions.

The next discussion was led by Susan Roxas, the fisheries lead of the Sustainable Tuna Partnership (STP) 2 project, regarding the conservation measures for juvenile catch reduction, MPA management for Tuna feeding grounds; research/studies needed to make a case for Payment Ecosystem Service (PES), which was also taken from the discussion of the previous dialogue meeting in Manila, August 2022. Through her presentation Susan asked the delegates on how the delegates want to proceed further the discussion regarding the common areas, which are juvenile catch reductions and protecting the nurseries and spawning grounds. This includes understand stakeholders' values and trade-offs, evaluate options for incentive and compensation schemes and identify roles and next steps needed. Susan also raised the possibility of exploring payment for ecosystem services.

It follows with Megan presentation on her study on the implication of harvest strategies for the coral triangle, as part of the STP 2 project. Specifically, the study aims to estimate potential and probably socio-economic and ecological implications of harvest strategies on Coral Triangle countries. One of the outcomes of the study is modelling the estimate of management measures that would go in place to change the way that fishing is occurring on one or more of these species and then we can assess the likely socio-economic impact for the future in coral triangle countries. The study has three main components: ecological, fishing, and economic. In the end, the delegates agreed to discuss virtually and decide type of management objectives scenarios needed to be modelled according to their countries needed, as the next step. Furthermore, Megan's presentation was followed by a discussion on parking lot issues, where it resulted in a 7-point written in the fourth section in this report.

The second day starts with discussion of sub-stock study and how the delegates want to move forward with the topic, which was led by Bubba Cook. Raffy Ramiscal stated that Philippine paper from genetics was submitted for the commission, if there is a sub stock, we should be managing it this together. This may relief us to some other pressure. The Philippine paper showed some differences from stocks in Philippine and Papua New Guinea. However, according to Pak Fayakun Satria "the topic is important, but there could be some sensitive issues if there are sub stocks. If it's different stocks, how can we manage that? It comes back to us. Every single assessment that comes from region 5 should go back to the three countries, if this species collapses only in this region the impact will felt by our fishers. Apparently, SKJ is quite domestic (sticks to this area). % of residence is high". Similarly, Dr. Hai stated that the understanding of tuna stocks in the waters is very important, we need to understand more have more research on the stock, movement and how they interact with other species, Ecosystem based approach. However, although the forum is willing to support further research, the intensive and significant works are required. Thus, the delegates agreed to not put it as a current priority.

It follows with the discussion of the next step of the group. Bubba Cook starts with a question to the delegates on their expectation and hope of their position in the WCPFC process. Pak Fayakun Satria starts with one of their common agenda this year is the discussion of the management strategy evaluation (MSE), where he thinks that the group needs to look carefully in particular for YFT management procedure, what are the consequences if they follow that direction proposed by the SPC, so, we need more discussion on this. Meanwhile, according to Mr. Rafael Ramiscal, as the WPEA project, has facilitated the three countries to be able to understand the science well, perhaps, what the group can move forward with this the dialogue is to be able for countries to have a better discussion prior to the commission to better understand and decide better. In other words, the three countries have a prior communication and come to the meetings as a group. Therefore, Dr. Lilian stated that the group need someone who will steer the group, during the dialogue to help the three countries express to be united as one powerful 'block'. However, Pak Fayakun Satria explained the challenges of three countries to understand the technicalities of the assessments due to the limited time given to them to read and understand the materials prior to the presentations and discussions as well as limited resources and capacity of the three countries to catch up with the experts of SPC. Additionally, Pak Fayakun also pointed out that the stock assessment workshop is delivered by SPC at the end of the process, where SPC did not give any chance or opportunity for countries to attend the meetings and online meetings and involve with the process, also presents challenges for the three countries. Ibu Putih added by saying that "if the scientist doesn't have the tech knowledge how can management deal with it, how can we get the measures, capacity building for the scientists. How the stock assessment is done, to give best advice to management. What if we need insights of the scientific?". Therefore, Bubba suggested that the group needs a secretariat that can help and facilitate the countries for all the discussion needed outside the scope of WPEA-ITM project and also using general approach first to identify what agenda that should be put as a priority for the countries to be discussed and specifies it prior to the WCPFC meetings. Additionally, the group also agreed to advocate for YFT specific harvest strategy and to convene another meeting prior to the Scientific meeting (SC).

In the end of the second day, the delegates discussed and agreed on a couple of things that are written in the fifth section of this report.

III. Feedbacks from Vietnam on the Manila SWOT analysis

1. Combat IUU fishing and commercial frauds as the one of the "common goals" identified in Manila meeting
2. Establish sub-region forum to share tuna data and information as an addition to the list of "short-term goals" identified in Manila meeting
3. (1) combatting IUUF and commercial frauds, and (2) implement Port-State Measures Agreement as an addition to "areas of cooperation" identified in Manila meeting
4. Vietnam agrees on the "agreements – Day 1" made in Manila meeting that Vietnam will also develop its own Harvest strategy in its waters in 2023 within the WPEA-ITM project

5. Promote cool-chain to reduce post-harvest loss for the small -scale vessels and support small-scale fisheries access to markets to be included into the priority to be addressed
6. The presence of tuna all time of the year and good processing facility and low production costs can be added into the common “strengths”
7. Insufficient understanding about the tuna stocks and their movement in the regional water can be added into the “weakness”
8. Being in the same situation of the fisheries and share the common benefits and voice in the international forums can be added into the “opportunities”
9. (1) A large number of fishing vessels and they are operated by household. The fishing communities are poor and vulnerable to natural disasters and climate changes. (2) Management system is so poor leading to the capacity in deterring and preventing IUU seafood products and commercial frauds is limited, can be added into the “threats”
10. In the East Asia sea can three countries establish a mechanism to manage the tuna fisheries within the east Asia sea? a question in the “discussion”

IV. Agreements – Day 1

1. The meeting acknowledges that there are common grounds for similar interests of the three countries for tuna fisheries management that can be tackled with a common voice aiming to better position ID PH and VN at the WCPFC meetings.
2. Vietnam presented comments and additions to the SWOT and areas for collaboration and formally agreed to join Philippines and Indonesia and to maintain the dialogue going forward.
3. the delegates are willing to conduct a dialogue to represent their common voice in WCPFC meetings:
 - i. The delegates agree on this proposed dialogue pending approval of higher authorities from their respective governments
 - ii. forming an interim secretariat is necessary to move forward with this dialogue, which the mechanism will be further discussed (learn from other collaborative mechanisms)
 - iii. by sharing the work among the delegations with each delegation tackling its area of expertise and briefing the others during preparatory meetings.
 - iv. The delegates intend to conduct the dialogue with preparatory sessions prior to the commission, science committee and other regular WCPFC meetings as needed
4. the “True Costs” study proposed during day 1 of the dialogue is acknowledged by the delegations who expressed interest in reviewing the results prior to the WCPFC meetings:
 - i. Countries need to identify management measures and its parameters
 - ii. test the model beforehand
5. Further discussions are needed between the organizing NGOs for resource allocation to continue supporting further dialogues.

6. The SPC mixed fisheries model needs further clarification on how SPC can handle an exceptional circumstance related to YFT Harvest Strategy. If no follow-up clarification has been given, a formal approach to SPC could be undertaken during the WPEA stock assessment workshop

V. Agreements – Day 2

1. Regarding the “True Costs” study proposed during day 1 of the dialogue:
 - The three countries want to be part of the study and thus, the countries proposed a call with Megan to clarify: (1) types of data needed (2) how data obtained (source of data) (3) the countries will propose to Megan on the types of management strategy based on their domestic need. However, the countries agreed to decide on unified parameters that will reflect impact on the region. (4) How Megan ensures data and its model protection. The call will be scheduled in the end of February or in the first week of March 2023
 - The three countries suggested that the model needs to be developed, where the countries can run it with their own data as well as its flexibility to be used in addressing both regional and national assessment.
 - The three countries suggested that, if schedules permit, the result can be presented in the science committee meeting next August 2023. At the same time, it demonstrates as the first outcome from the 3-country collaboration.
 - As the modelling result will be issued, according to the timeline of the study, on April 2023, the countries suggested to have a face-to-face workshop on May 2023 to review and discuss the results and its implications.
2. Regarding harvest strategy for yellowfin tuna:
 - The three countries agreed to continue to develop target reference point together to get ready for the 2024, where the true cost study result can be used as the reference
 - The countries agreed that YFT is critical to each of their countries and that small scale fishers take up the majority of fishers, the socio-economic impact of fisheries collapse will be very detrimental to their development path. Such impact will be modelled by the true cost scenarios.
 - The countries agreed to ask the same assistance as the pacific countries have from the SPC, the scientific provider of the WCPFC, by arguing on the same characteristics as the small island developing states (SIDS)
 - The countries agreed to have a common position, backed up by sufficient scientific justification, on a single species harvest strategy for yellowfin tuna, to be submitted to the annual commission meeting
 - As there will be a preparatory workshop for stock assessment for the three countries under the platform of WPEA in March, the countries agreed to have a call to discuss the follow up action
3. Regarding the project of Western Pacific East Asia (WPEA) project
 - As the project has no additional cost extension until March 2025, the countries will seek new funding to continue to build and improve the quality of data collection

4. The countries observed that other areas of the WPEA remit, such as climate change and supply chain issues, had been precluded previously due to lack of funding, however they could be included in a call for continued support for WPEA Regarding the discussion of the potential sub-stock in the region
 - The delegates agreed not to prioritize the discussion of a potential sub-stock in the region until enough funding could be raised to conduct further research needed to support the discussion
5. Other Matters:
 - The delegates agreed the importance and the need of having an awareness campaign in their countries as well as at the regional level to maintain YFT sustainably at the WCPO

VI. Timeline for the next event

NO	Month	Time
1	Bangkok triologue meeting ID-PH-VN	15 -16 February 2023
2	Key points of the triologue meeting to be circulated and finalized by the delegates	4 th week of February 2023
3	Draft report of the triologue meeting	4 th week of March 2023
4	a call with Megan Bailey to discuss and clarify for the true cost study	21 March 2023
5	Preparatory stock assessment workshop conducted by WPEA and SPC?	4 th week of March 2023
6	a call between ID-PH-VN to discuss the outcomes of the preparatory stock assessment workshop and to plan for the scientific meeting19?	April 2023
7	Indonesia Tuna Conference	9 May 2023
8	Face-to-face meeting with Megan Bailey for the model simulation	4 th week of May 2023
9	Abstract of the true cost study is submitted for the SC19 meeting	Mid July 2023
10	WCPFC Science meeting 19 (SC19) @Palau	3 rd and 4 th week of August 2023
11	3rd dialogue meeting ID-PH-VN to discuss the outcome of the SC19 and to prepare for the WCPFC20 meeting?	November 2023
12	WCPFC20 meeting @Cook Island	1 st week of December 2023

<p>Indonesia</p> <p>Dr. Fayakun Satria, the Head of Center for Fisheries Research - Research Organization for Earth Sciences and Maritime - the Indonesian National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN)</p> <p>Dr. Lilis Sadiyah, the Researcher, Center for Fisheries Research - Research Organization for Earth Sciences and Maritime - the Indonesian National Research and Innovation Agency (BRIN)</p> <p>Putuh Suadela, Directorate of Fisheries Resources Management, Indonesia Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (MMAF)</p>	<p>Philippines</p> <p>Raffy Ramiscal, Head of Capture Fisheries, Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR)</p> <p>Isidro Tanangonan, BFAR</p> <p>Angelica Villafuerte, BFAR</p> <p>Dr. Lilian C Garcia, Executive Director of the National Fisheries Research and Development Institute (NFRDI)</p> <p>Suzette Barcoma, Scientist of NFRDI</p>	<p>Vietnam</p> <p>Vu Duyen Hai, Deputy Director of the Capture Fisheries Department - DFish</p> <p>Nguyen Quy Duong, Official of the Capture Fisheries Department – Dfish</p> <p>Phan Dang Liem, Scientist of the Research Institute of Marine Fisheries (RIMF)</p>
<p>MDPI</p> <p>Kai Garcia (Program Strategy Lead)</p> <p>Putra Timur (Fisheries Lead)</p>	<p>WWF</p> <p>Bubba Cook (Pacific Region Coordinator)</p> <p>Nilmawati (CTP)</p> <p>Susan Roxas (CTP)</p> <p>Jialing Lim (CTP)</p> <p>Joann Binondo (WWF PH)</p> <p>Binh Young Trong (WWF – VN)</p>	<p>Virtual Attendees:</p> <p>Raisa Pandan (WWF PH)</p> <p>Astrid Ocampo (WWF PH)</p>

ANNEXES

1. Attendees and Agenda

2. Agenda Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam Dialogue Meeting Of Harvest Strategy Implementation For Tuna Fisheries In Western Coastal Pacific Ocean

Day 1: Wednesday 15th February 2023

Link to presentations:

Time	Activity and Desired Outcome	Responsible Person	Moderator
09.00-9:15	Welcome remarks and group photo	WWF	Nilmawati
09.15-9:30	Introduction	WWF	Nilmawati
09.30-09:40	Review August meeting report, SWOT analysis, areas for collaboration, common goals, follow-up actions to deliver goals.	WWF-CTP: Susan Roxas	Nilmawati
09.40-09.50	ID presentation on HS (updates) in IAW	BRIN: Fayakun Satria	Putuh Suadela
09.50-10.00	QnA/clarificatory questions		
10.00-10.10	PH presentation on HS (updates)	BFAR: Raffy Ramiscal	Sid Tanangonan
10.10-10.20	QnA/clarificatory questions		
10.20-10.40	Vietnam's presentation on current management measures and performance	DFISH: Mr. Hai	Binh
10.40-10.50	QnA/clarificatory questions		
10:50-11:05	Break		
11:05 – 11:25	SPC's presentation on the development of HS of YFT in WCPO	Finlay Scott (online)	Lilis Sadiyah
11:25 – 11:35	QnA/clarificatory questions		
11.35 – 12.05	Review on SWOT analysis; Present Vietnam's feedback; Group adopts the collective statement and agrees to integrate Vietnam's feedback.	WWF- CTP: Susan Roxas	
12:05 – 13:05	Lunch Break		
13.05-15.00	Discussion: Take stock of outcomes from the WCPFC, reflections and agree on actions going forward in preparation for the Scientific Meeting (SC19) and WCPFC20 (consensus building on priority issues), agree on common positions, e.g., TRP for YFT and BE, allocations for SKJ HS, transparency (VMS and AIS measures) and human welfare (Labor standard)	WWF	Bubba Cook
15:00 – 15:15	Working Coffee break		
15:15 – 15:25	Discuss conservation measures for juvenile catch reduction, MPA management for tuna feeding grounds; research/studies needed to make a	Susan	Joann Binondo

	case for Payment Ecosystem Service (PES).		
15:25 – 15:35	Discussion		
16:00 – 16:30	Present proposal for tuna HS catches reduction simulation study (Day 1 agreement, Item 6 for decision), includes cost/benefit of implementing HCR. Identify HCRs for scenario modelling <i>Draft Terms of Reference to be distributed for review and discussion.</i>	Dalhousie University: Megan Bailey (online)	
16:30 – 16:45	Discussion		
16:45 – 17:15	Address “parking lot” (other issues) issues and agree on agenda for Day 2	MDPI	Kai/Wildan
17:15	End of Day 1		
18:00	Dinner		

Day 2: Thursday 16th February 2023

Time	Activity and Desired Outcome	Responsible Person	Moderator
9:30 – 9:45	Overview of Day 1 outcomes	MDPI – WWF CTP	Kai
09.45 – 10.05	Present sub-stock study for discussion and decision to move forward	WWF	Bubba Cook
10.05-10.15	Discussion		
10:15-11:00	Review position of the group on management strategy workplans for YFT, Albacore and BET to 2024: collective statements, agree on research/preparatory work for 2023 to strengthen collective positions/statements; allocate tasks and responsibilities	WWF	Bubba, Lars Olsen
11.00-11:15	Working Coffee break		
11.15-12.00	Continue the previous discussion (finalize)		
12.00-13.00	Lunch		
13:00-14:30	Agree on schedule for meetings in 2023 to action the goal of 'engaging more in the science discussion to better prepare for the conferences' and follow-up on actions agreed		Bubba Cook
14:30 – 15:00	Wrap up – close the meeting	MDPI – WWF CTP	Nilmawati - Kai